

Concordia University
Council of the John Molson School of Business
Minutes of the meeting held
Friday, February 13, 2004

Present: J. Tomberlin (Chair)
K. Argheyd (Mana.), C. Bayne (DS&MIS), P. Bolla (Facil.), A. Dhillon (CGSA),
A. Fagnoli (Reg.), S. Fontaine (Staff), J. Freed (Fina.), E. Gatbonton (TESL),
M. Genova (Staff), S. K. Goyal (DS&MIS), S. Hoffman (Lib.), N. Howe (SGS),
A. B. Ibrahim (Assoc. Dean), G. Kanaan (Assoc. Dean), D. Kira (DS&MIS),
K. Laframboise (DS&MIS), F. Lowy (Rector), G. Lypny (Fina.), M. Magnan
(Assoc. Dean), J. McConnell (CASA), D. Morin (Assoc. Dean), S. Mustafa
(Acco.), T. O'Connell (Mana.), R. J. Oppenheimer (Mana.), D. Peltier-Rivest
(Acco.), M. Perugini (CASA), K. Chin Quee (CGSA), I. Rakita (Fina.), A. Robin
(CASA), S. Robinson (Acco.), C. A. Ross (Mktg.), M. Sharma (DS&MIS),
K. Soufani (Fina.), C. Y. Suen (Comp. Sci.), M. Thakor (Mktg.), M. Wichterle
(CASA)

Absent with
Regret: J. Ahmad (Econ.), T. Alameddine (CASA), O. Bodur (Mktg.), D. Cameron
(Mana.), A.-M. Croteau (DS&MIS), R. Ferguson (MBA), G. Fisher (Econ.),
R. Knitter (Mana.), J. Lightstone (Provost), G. Lowenfeld (Acco.), F. Nebebe
(DS&MIS), M.-E. Turcotte (CASA), M. Wou (CASA)

Guest: B. Black (Thursday Report)

I Call to Order
The meeting was called to order at 09:35.

At the Chair's request, it was agreed that the agenda be adapted to accommodate the Rector's schedule.

The Rector reported that the start of the new JMSB building would be delayed awaiting the contribution of the government in the amount of approximately \$50M. He explained that the project was initially planned and approved by the Board of Governors at a cost of \$68M but with the addition of two floors and the many architectural change orders, the cost has increased to \$92M. The Real Estate Committee of the Board recommends proceeding with the larger version of the plan and there is confidence that the balance of the money can be found to supplement the government allocation: in addition to the University's funding from bonds, \$10M has been donated by the Molson Foundation and two potential donations in the amount of \$10M each are under discussion. He advised that starting the building at this point could jeopardize the University's A rating by the Dominion Bond Rating Service and eradicate any incentive for the government to fund the project. The Rector stated that he was optimistic that the government funding would be forthcoming. Once there is confirmation of the government's commitment the University would be in a position to take a loan and start the building.

One member of Council stated that if the delay goes beyond one year, the University should proceed with the original model. He noted however that the HEC building erected several years ago now requires a 30% expansion.

JMSB-2004-02M

In response to a question about the impact of the delay in the construction of the new building would have on enrolment and related government financing, the Dean replied that JMSB enrolment was constrained by the inability to attract new faculty more than by lack of teaching space.

In response to a concern about the effect of private fund raising on the government's decisions, the Rector gave his assurances that such community support encourages the government's generosity.

It was estimated that it would take approximately twenty months from ground breaking to move-in.

II Closed Meeting

III Open Meeting

IV Approval of Agenda - JMSB-2004-02A

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by M. Thakor that Council approve the agenda as presented. The motion was carried unanimously.

V Approval of the Minutes - JMSB-2004-01M

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Robinson that Council approve the minutes of the meeting held January 16, 2004. The motion was carried unanimously.

VI Chair's Report and Question Period (*maximum 15 minutes*)

With regard to the appointment of the Director of the International Center for Aviation Management Education and Research (ICAMER) brought up at the January meeting, J. Tomberlin advised that ICAMER had been set up as a separate corporation with its own by-laws owned by the University. According to the by-laws the membership, including the appointment of the Director, is appointed by the Dean for an unspecified term. Due to the minimal activities of ICAMER the current membership consists of the Legal Counsel of the University, the Dean and D. Doreen.

With regard to recent happenings, J. Tomberlin reported the success of the Air Currents Conference held in Ottawa, January 26 – 28th. The conference was opened by Minister of Transport, T. Valeri and chaired by D. J. Carty, retired Chairman and CEO, AMR Corporation, parent company of American Airlines and American Eagle, Past President of CP Air. The conference, co-sponsored by McGill's Institute of Air and Space Law and UBC's Sauder School of Business, was aimed at providing air transport policy directives for the new government. The conference attracted heavy participation from members of the Ministry of Transport and major players within the Canadian transport scene. The proceedings will be soon available.

J. Tomberlin announced the donation of \$1M by the National Bank for Ph.D. Fellowships in Finance. This will provide five \$20,000 scholarships per year for a period of ten years, will have an immediate impact on the recruitment of Ph.D. students in Finance and will ease the JMSB operating budget that has contributed approximately \$100,000 towards Ph.D. student support. In addition, he reported that the University has a new Ph.D. Fellowship program that has been allocated to the Faculties according to the number of

Ph.D. graduates. The JMSB expects to have three new \$15,000 Ph.D. Fellowships per year for a three-year period.

The Dean congratulated the FISA organizers on the success of the Third Annual Undergraduate Case Competition held February 5 – 7 that attracted thirteen universities from five provinces and one from the State of Texas.

With regard to the strategic planning process, J. Tomberlin reported that the last interviews with part-time faculty and students have just been concluded. The first draft of the strategic plan is expected to be ready soon for distribution to the departments for discussion and feedback.

With reference to the Dean's e-mail to all faculty and staff regarding an article appearing in the Cleveland Plain Dealer implying the existence of a joint MBA/CFA program between Concordia University and Case Western Reserve University (CWRU), a member of Council asked the Dean what response he had received from his communication with CWRU. J. Tomberlin reported that he had received confirmation from the spokesperson of CWRU that no such program exists.

- VII Report: Administrative Affairs and Human Resources
Guest: Susan Magor, Director, Environmental Health and Safety
B. Ibrahim introduced S. Magor to address the numerous complaints received by his office about the quality of air in the GM building.

It was moved by B. Ibrahim and seconded by M. Sharma that Council grant speaking privileges to S. Magor, Director, Environmental Health and Safety.

The motion was carried unanimously.

S. Magor advised that the increase in complaints can be largely attributed to the construction activities for the new Engineering/Visual Arts complex. The Office of Environmental Health and Safety, located in the GM building, has been working with O&Y, the managers of the GM building, and the Health and Safety Commission to investigate complaints from faculty and staff since last January. They have identified a number of problems and developed an action plan. Issues include overheating, insufficient heating, black dust, humidity and overcrowding. Replacement of the entire ventilation system has been ruled out because of the expense and the expected 3-year term until the move to the new JMSB building. The action plan calls for some of the ducts to be replaced on the lower floors, filters to be installed in the ventilation system to eliminate the black dust, the replacement of the ventilation system in GM212 and the replacement of some cleaning products to reduce noxious fumes. She advised that although little can be done about the noise of the construction, they have traced the diesel fumes entering the ventilation system to a cement truck in need of a tune up. The cement truck has been replaced and hopefully the complaint about fumes has been resolved. She emphasized the importance of directing all complaints to local 2400, the client center for Facilities Management.

P. Bolla advised that construction of the atrium between the new building and the GM building, that will impact all offices on the three-quarters of the south wall from the

second to fourth floor, was expected to begin during the summer. The new building will be connected to the GM building at the metro and main floor levels.

One member of Council requested that carpets on the second floor that have been affected by soot be cleaned on a regular basis.

Members of Council thanked S. Magor for her report

VIII Elections

S. Fontaine was elected by acclamation to represent the administrative staff on the JMSB Council Steering Committee effective immediately and terminating September 2004.

IX Business Arising from Previous Meeting

- i) Notice of Motion regarding tenure-track faculty members teaching first year undergraduate courses— JMSB-2004-01A-05 and JMSB-2004-02A-01
It was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by C. A. Ross that 60% of the first year undergraduate classes at the John Molson School of Business be taught by tenured or tenure-track faculty members with effect from the Fall term 2004.

S. Goyal explained that the motion was motivated by the importance the MacLeans rankings placed on this factor. According to document JMSB-2004-02A-01 less than 22% of our undergraduate courses are taught by tenured or tenure track faculty members. He invited a debate on the role of the undergraduate program in the JMSB in light of the fact that most tenured and tenure track faculty prefer to teach small graduate classes rather than large undergraduate classes.

The impact in the shift from graduate to undergraduate teaching would have on the graduate programs was questioned. It was commented that well qualified part-time faculty with practical business experience contribute significantly to the value of the undergraduate degree. In addition the JMSB does not have sufficient resources to hire enough full-time tenure track faculty to provide 60% coverage in the undergraduate program and maintain graduate programs. It was noted that schools that ranked well in this category ranked poorly in the class size category. It was further noted that this category had less weight than the class size category. One Council member commented that a debate was valueless unless the JMSB decides to be governed by the dictates of the MacLean's ranking system. Another member pointed out that the motion discriminates against ETAs and that workload was not within the purview of Council. As dictated by the CUFA collective agreement, workload assignments are the realm of the Dean in consultation with the Department Chairs.

During the ensuing discussion several members of Council expressed support for the spirit of the motion. The notion of giving first years students exposure to the teaching, concepts and philosophies of faculty scholars was endorsed. At the same time, it was demonstrated that the motion could not be implemented due to constrained resources without sacrificing the education of second and third year undergraduates and the graduate programs. S. Goyal was commended

for his intentions and there was general agreement that the JMSB continue to strive to maintain the AACSB 60% ratios that includes tenured, tenure track, ETA and LTA faculty with a view to enriching the undergraduate program with faculty scholars.

The mover and the seconder withdrew the motion.

- ii) Notice of Motion regarding JMSB faculty representation on Committees/Boards – JMSB-2004-01A-06

The following resolution was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by S. Goyal:

Whereas it is important that the views of ordinary faculty members be well represented on Faculty and University fora,

Whereas there is currently at least one Faculty where only regular faculty members in addition to the Dean sit on Senate,

Whereas the University is committed to transparency in all its non-confidential proceedings,

Whereas the grassroots faculty members have an important role to play in achieving the strategic objectives of the business school,

Be it resolved that only the members of Concordia University Faculty Association (CUFA) of the JMSB should be eligible to represent faculty views in all committees/boards at all levels within the University.

If this motion is passed by the Faculty Council of the JMSB then it is expected that non-members of CUFA who are currently representing the views of JMSB faculty members will resign from their memberships with immediate effect.

C.A. Ross explained that the spirit of the motion is to ensure a voice for faculty members on all University and Faculty committees. He stated that the Dean and Associate Deans represent only the view of the administration not the views of individual faculty members. In keeping with the tenets of Article 9.05 of the CUFA collective agreement, he suggested that excluded members of the bargaining unit who may not sit on Department Personnel Committees, Faculty Personnel and Tenure Committees, be deemed ineligible to sit on all University and Faculty committees including Senate where it is now possible for the JMSB to be represented by the Dean and three Associate Deans. He reported that the Arts & Science Faculty has an unwritten rule that Vice-Deans are ineligible to sit on Senate.

It was argued that the Senate election was conducted in a democratic process that gave each faculty member the opportunity to place his/her vote. Objection was raised concerning CUFA's trend towards exclusion that has created multi levels of eligibility for various procedures and committees that impact negatively on our new and productive faculty members. It was suggested that CUFA take further exclusion of rights of participation to the negotiation table for the next

collective agreement. Objection was also raised about the notion of further exclusion of faculty administrators who, in addition to performing normal faculty duties, undertake the burden management for modest stipends.

It was suggested that this issue was not within the purview of Council as the motion would impose restrictions on the Chair's ability to ensure qualified representation on department committees. If it were limited to the committees of Council, debate would have value. In response, C. Ross stated that Council was the supreme body of the JMSB that had the power to make rules about how the faculty is run, including the operations of the departments.

The mover and the seconder withdrew the motion.

- iii) Review of Format for Private Program Reports – JMSB-2004-02A-02
This item will be brought forward to the next meeting of Council.

- X Report: Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation – JMSB-2004-02A-03
This item will be brought forward to the next meeting of Council.

- XI Standing Report on the status of the new JMSB building

- XII CASA Report

- XIII Report: External Affairs and Executive Programs
Awards Committee Composition and Mandate – JMSB-2004-02A-04
This item will be brought forward to the next meeting of Council.

- XIV Report: Undergraduate Programs, Academic and Student Affairs
 - i) Report from the Distinguished Teaching Award Committee – JMSB-2004-02A-05
It was moved by G. Kanaan and seconded by M. Thakor that Council approve the proposed composition and mandate of the Distinguished Teaching Awards committee as presented in document JMSB-2004-02A-04.

G. Kanaan outlined the proposal highlighting the changes from the current procedures.

Objection was raised about the inequity of awarding \$5,000 to full-time faculty for teaching development and \$1,000 to part-time faculty. Full-time and part-time faculty should have an equal opportunity to choose the preferred award. Alternatively, winners could choose to take the \$5,000 with the commitment to a teaching enhancement activity or the \$1,000 cash gift with no encumbrances or both full-time and part-time faculty could be awarded \$2,500. It was also suggested that part-time faculty be defined as regular members of the part-time faculty union. It was argued that the criteria for full-time and part-time faculty would have to be equal if the reward were to be of equal value.

One member of Council asked that the criteria for the awards distinguish what is expected of ETAs, LTAs and part-timers, tenure-track and tenured faculty. He further requested a clarification on the number of awards to be made each year and recommended that the selection committee not be restricted to past recipients of the award to allow more flexibility. Another member complained that LTAs were almost completely excluded from the process.

G. Kanaan advised that the criteria is intended to be a guideline to inform the candidates of what the committee would be looking for. With regard to the number of awards, the word normally implies the flexibility to have years with no awards and years with more than one award. The expectation is that there would be one full-time and one part-time award per year.

One faculty member suggested that there be one award for each department.

S. Goyal called the question. A vote was taken on calling the question: Defeated – (1 in favour, 2 opposed, 15 abstentions)

In light of a perceived correlation between excellent teaching evaluations and high grades it was suggested that course evaluations be accompanied by the students' GPAs.

It was clarified that course remissions were not given for student supervision. One three-credit course remission is awarded to the supervisor of a doctoral student who successfully completes his/her dissertation.

It was moved by J. Freed and seconded by S. Goyal that the motion be amended for all winners of the JMSB Distinguished Teaching Awards to have the choice between taking \$5,000 for a teaching research project or \$1,000 in cash.

A vote was taken on the amendment. The amendment was defeated - (7 in favour, 11 opposed, 0 abstentions)

It was recommended that the election of the committee be from among the full-time faculty excluding Associate Deans. It was further recommended that the election be a faculty-wide election rather than a Faculty Council election.

It was moved by G. Lypny and seconded by S. Goyal that the motion be withdrawn and the selection of the winners of the JMSB Distinguished Teaching Award be left to the students.

A vote was taken. The motion was defeated - (5 in favour, 13 opposed, 0 abstentions)

It was moved by A. Dhillon and seconded by M. Thakor that the motion be amended for all winners of the JMSB Distinguished Teaching Awards to be given \$3,000 to be used for teaching related activities using FRDP guidelines.

JMSB-2004-02M

The mover indicated that this was a friendly amendment however no vote was taken.

It was reiterated that equal rewards would require selection based on equal standards.

It was suggested that the committee consider the input of Council members and return with a revised document at the next meeting of Council.

Due the late start of the process and the delay in the approval of the proposed procedures, it was agreed that the committee would revert to the current procedures for the 2004 JMSB Distinguished Teaching Awards.

It was moved by B. Ibrahim and seconded by M. Sharma that the motion be tabled.

The motion to table was carried (17 in favour, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions)

The meeting was adjourned prior to dealing with the following items.

- XV Reports from School Representatives on University Committees
 - i) University Senate
 - ii) Arts and Science Faculty Council
 - iii) Senate Academic Planning and Priorities
 - iv) Senate Academic Programs Committee
 - v) Senate Research Committee - JMSB-2004-02A-06
 - vi) University Library Committee – Nothing to Report
 - vii) Undergraduate Scholarships and Awards Sub-committee
 - viii) Board of Governors - Nothing to report
 - ix) Council of the School of Graduate Studies

XVI CGSA Report

XVII New Business

XVIII Other Business

XIX Adjournment

*It was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by K. Argheyd that the meeting be adjourned.
The motion was carried unanimously.*

The meeting was adjourned at 12:40.

XX Next meeting

The next regular meeting of Council is scheduled on Friday, March 12, 2004 room GM302.